

THE PROCEDURE OF THE PERFORMANCE AUDIT OF HEALTH TOURISM FINANCING BY VOUCHERS IN THE REPUBLIC OF SERBIA

Jelica Eremić-Đodić¹; Aleksandra Tomić²;

Abstract

The aim of the paper is to develop the audit procedure for financing health tourism in the function of the performance audits in order to determine the status that would support the development of tourism in the Republic of Serbia. The first step in the process is to identify the requirements and to establish the key control points. Based on the request, the impact of this grant on the development of health tourism will be determined. On the basis of the obtained audit findings, the results will be compared to each other in order to build the appropriate basis which will be the starting point for development of the audit procedure. Audit findings are used to measure the model that evaluates the efficiency of spending the funds received in vouchers in financing tourism, assess the efficiency of cooperation of tourist communities with health institutions and contributions to the development of the RS.

Key Words: *performance audit, tourism, health tourism, vouchers*

JEL classification: *M42, Z30*

Introduction

During his entire existence, a man moved and travelled. The reasons for this are different and are intertwined every day. Therefore, the claim that tourism started with the first travellings and migrations is completely justified. The root or etymology, of the word tourism according to the dictionaries, comes from an English word tour used in describing a circle.

¹ Jelica Eremić-Đodić, EPS Distribucija doo Beograd/ Assistant Professor, Educons University, Faculty of Business Economics, 064/837-2738, e-mail: jelicaerdjo01@gmail.com

² Aleksandra Tomić, Associate Professor, Faculty of Management, Sremski Karlovci/National Assembly of the Republic of Serbia, 062/296-300, e-mail: aleksandra.tomic.bgd@gmail.com

It involves a circular itinerary in that tourists return to their point of origin, home (Marković, 2019).

The Republic of Serbia, as well as many other countries in the world, invests in tourism. Although tourism is still in progress, there are exact suggestions and actions in that direction.

In accordance to the second task defined in the Tourism Strategy RS for period 2016-2025. (p. 44), monitoring, implementation of the law, regulations and norms of acceptable conducting and performing activities (inspections), the objective of this research is to make a suggestion procedure for the performance audits of health tourism by the Serbian government (RS).

The concept of tourism is diverse. For some, it only represents vacation, travel, recreation, and even leisure time with no money. For others who are employed in the Tourism Sector, it represents a profession, intensive work and ability to earn money, and get a career.

One thing is certain: more of them emphasize the contribution of tourism to health, education, culture, as well as the contribution to peace; increasing labor productivity, developing rural areas and a lot of other benefits are also tourism contribution.

Health tourism in the Republic of Serbia (RS)

It is very difficult to measure how much the development of tourism influences the economy. The reasons for this are multiple:

- tourism cannot be considered as a single activity, but as a set of different activities whose demand is not reflected only in tourist demand;
- some tourist products are partly unnecessary and therefore difficult to measure either by physical or financial indicators. The impact of tourism can be shown by increasing employment (especially when it is a tourist season), using the value that indicates domestic currency, trade, etc.

There are various types of tourism, and its "specific forms are: health tourism, cultural, hunting and fishing, ecotourism, congress, religious tourism, manifestation tourism, tourism with a topic of gastronomy, tourism with the theme of wine roads ("Types of tourism", 2019).

When looking at health tourism, we must first of all carefully consider the needs of both domestic and foreign population when planning their vacation, recreation, treatment or rehabilitation. When it comes to our country, it is necessary, along with this analysis, to look how rich are mountain areas, hot springs, vegetation and other resources that greatly influence both the development of health tourism and tourism in general.

According to this, the Republic of Serbia has been trying for several years so far to introduce the measures that would attract tourists and contribute to the overall development of tourism. The aim of this work is to see, through the performance audit, how well these measures are successful. The further step is an attempt to assess how the measures taken improve the development of health tourism in its overall development. A health tourism product consists of two components: health and wellness. The health tourism offer is based on the treatment and therapy of visitors with health problems in order to improve their health... On the other hand, wellness tourism refers to the provision of services to healthy people who, through certain treatments, keep their good health and improve the quality of their life (Popović et al., 2013).

Respecting the criteria for obtaining and realizing the vouchers in the form of an anonymous questionnaire, a Questionnaire was formed which should provide necessary information in order to find a procedure for the performance audit of health tourism financing through the voucher in RS. Based on the answers obtained by completing the Questionnaire and the established audit procedure, a conclusion will be made on the assessment of the efficiency of promotion and improvement of tourism as well as the assessment of the efficiency of cooperation with health institutions in the function of the performance audit.

Anonymous Survey - Questionnaire

General issues

Executive Level Department	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - hotels - tourist agencies - special hospital
Management of the Institution (Director, Assistant Directors, Head Nurse of the Institution, Technical Secretary)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - managers, - heads of marketing services in travel agencies

	- hotel owners, - owners of the apartment
Department for Legal, Personnel and Administrative Affairs -Operational level	- receptionist
Department of Economic, Financial and Accounting Affairs	- heads of the Economic and Financial Service,
Sale department (for tourist arrangements)	- marketing services, - sales service.
other:	- physicians

2. What is the area of your professional engagement?

Physicians, managers, financiers, marketing, sales department, accounting stuff, owners

What is the total number of employees in your institution?(10-200).

Please tick the correct answer.

Do you think that the amount of grants for national tourism by vouchers is satisfactory?

Unsatisfactory	Poor	Medium	Satisfactory	More than enough
----------------	------	--------	--------------	------------------

Do you agree that the vouchers can only be used for accommodation services or would you allow it to be used for some other purpose?

Unsatisfactory	Poor	Medium	Satisfactory	More than enough
----------------	------	--------	--------------	------------------

Please specify which other purpose: **for all types tourist services.**

Questionnaire

The importance of general characteristics		1	2	3	4	5
1.	How much the subsidized vouchers in domestic tourism helped you to boost sales of your hotel facilities? (Rate from 1 to 5; 1 - unsatisfactory, 2 - poor, 3 – medium, 4 – satisfactory, 5 - more than enough)			x		
2.	How much is the sale of your hotel services sold for health tourism using vouchers in relation to the total sales of services?	x				

	comparing to the previous year?					
15.	How much the number of nights has increased by users of the right to financial compensation for the help and care by another person in accordance to the law on pension and disability insurance, comparing to the previous year?		X			
16.	How much the number of nights has increased by employed persons with incomes, which do not exceed the amount of 60,000 dinars per month; comparing to the previous year?			X		
17.	How much the number of nights has increased by war disabled persons and civil disabled persons of war with incomes, which do not exceed the amount of 60,000 dinars per month; comparing to the previous year?			X		
18.	How much the number of nights has increased by users of the right to a financial compensation for family pension of war victims comparing to the previous year?			X		
19.	How much the number of nights has increased for householders who have declared themselves exclusively engaged in agriculture, who are registered in the Register of Agricultural Holdings in accordance with the Law on Agriculture and Rural Development ("Official Gazette of the Republic of Serbia" No. 41/09 and 10/13 - 101/16)?			X		
20.	How many tourist voucher users have used spas and health services (examinations, treatment, diagnostics).			X		
21.	How many weekend arrangements of wellness services in spas has been sold since the beginning of voucher sale.				X	
22.	How many agencies have wellness and spas in their offer.				X	
23.	Assess precisely sorted voucher by users: how many pensioners, disabled people, etc. by all categories in relation to those entitled to a subsidy?	X				

24. Did the voucher users come alone or accompanied by a spouse or other person who does not have the right for stimulus?

Most of them come accompanied by a spouse or other person.

25. Has the number of voucher users who did not come alone increased comparing to last year? Yes.

26. Have the vouchers users already been on holiday in Serbia or they are here for the first time? Most of them came for the first time.

27. What was the average number of nights for voucher users?

The average number of nights for voucher users was 5-6 nights.

28. Do foreign tourists take some benefits?

No, they do not. There is only 1% of foreign tourists, mainly on medical rehabilitation or private arrangement.

29. Do you submit to the Ministry of Tourism any of the forms related to the subsidy through the voucher?

Invoice, the bill, voucher; (the founder will submit to the Ministry of Tourism.)

30. Is your work supported by a computer and appropriate software support?

Yes, but not much.

31. Do you have written process procedures?

No.

32. Do you comply to them in your work?

Only the legal regulations.

33. Do you have a record of how many tourists who used vouchers with you have realized vouchers in another institution?

Of the total number of registered vouchers, one third was used by us, and two thirds were realized in other institutions.

34. Do you have a record of how many tourists have used vouchers in your resorts and also health tourism services at the same time?

Out of out total number of surveyed institutions, one quarter is keeping records on health tourism.

The procedure of the performance audit of health tourism financing by vouchers in the Republic of Serbia

There are many types of control in theory and practice. What is supposed to be a common feature of each is their performance. The performance audit is a systematic, substantive, organizational and targeted reasearching of the activities of the Government or other budget users in order to assess whether entities in the implementation of programs or procedures, individual activities or functions work on economic principles

(Vidovič & Milunović, 2017). In order to implement the procedure of the performance audit, it is necessary to take the following steps:

1. Analyze the current state of the business activities related to the realization of the voucher, which is in accordance with the Tourism Development Strategy of the Republic of Serbia for the period 2016-2025;
2. Consider all necessary legal regulations;
3. Establish the written procedures in the catering facilities and tourist organizations which are on the list, where tourists can use vouchers for the accommodation service;
4. if there are written procedures of business activities in catering facilities, check whether they are applied;
5. evaluate their internal control;
6. review the design, effectiveness and efficiency of internal controls in order to determine their financial performance;
7. Identify risk control points;
8. Test the control points
9. Issue a proposal for internal control.

Management in the organization provides support to the environment by prescribing certain acts, procedures and guidelines (Eremić-Đođić et al., 2018b) for every business process.

In order to realize the internal control system of any client, it is necessary to analyze well all the policies and procedures that exist in this organization, or the catering facility / tourist organization.

What is the internal control actually? We find different definitions in literature. IFAC has given its own definition in which it says that internal control is a process that is designed, implemented and maintained by managers, management and other staff with the ability to provide reasonable assurance in achieving the objectives of the entity in relation to the reliability of financial reporting, the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities, and compliance with relevant laws and regulations (International Federation of Accountants, 2009).

What is an important thing for internal audit is certainly a controlling environment. It's the starting point. The established control procedures also represent an area which is extremely important for regular work of internal audit. The application for posting, i.e. the established accounting system is indispensably important, as well as the established monitoring.

Before the auditor designs his tests it is necessary to consider whether he can rely on the client's internal control or not. The extent of the tests depends on this. If it can not rely on the client's internal control, the auditor designs the tests assuming maximum level of control risk. In order to document the client's internal control, the auditor rely on discussions with the appropriate client's staff, reviewing accounting documents and procedural manuals (Andrić et al., 2012).

Control points for the procedure of the performance audit of health tourism financing by vouchers in the Republic of Serbia:

Checkpoints for organizations receiving vouchers (before obtaining a voucher from the Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications):

1. Is the institution for which it is applied on the list of catering facilities in which a reservation can be made for the purpose of realization of the voucher for the accommodation service?
2. Does the Certificate issued by the hotel for obtaining a voucher at the Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications has a validity period until November 20, 2019?
3. If the certificate is issued by the hotel does it contain all the necessary data to be applied from the Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications for the purpose of obtaining a voucher- name and surname, ID, the name of the facility and the correct address, business identification number of the hotel that issues the bill and in what period will it be used?
4. If the certificate is issued by a travel agency, does it contain all the necessary information in order to be applied to the Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications for the purpose of obtaining a voucher?
5. Review of issued certificates by the organization for the purpose of obtaining a voucher containing the following information: name and surname of the person to whom the certificate was issued, name of the facility and during what period will the facility be used?

B. Checkpoints for organizations receiving vouchers (after obtaining a voucher from the Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications):

1. Review the realized vouchers in the hotel on a monthly basis with the following data: name and surname, ID, name of the hotel, the correct address and during what period the voucher has been used?
2. At the monthly level, the documentation related to payment via voucher has to be completed for all vouchers in the following manner:

voucher, invoice.as follows (one original copy given to the client, leave the second copy for the accounting department, and transfer the third set to the Ministry of Trade, tourism and telecommunications).

C. Suggestion of models of necessary activities for the purpose of performance audit for vouchers - results obtained by controlling comparative records:

1. Make a comparative overview of realized certificates and realized vouchers on a monthly basis in all organizations that are on the list of catering facilities where a reservation can be made
2. Separate the issued certificates that are not covered by the realized vouchers.
3. Perceive did the organizations that issued the certificate to a user, might have had an extra costs if the certificate was not implemented in accordance with the request for confirmation, but has already been used for another purpose.
4. Create a vouchers recording which have been implemented in accordance with a certificate in the same facility, but in another time period.
5. Create a record of guests who paid the vouchers for a lodging in the hotel, and actually used health tourism services.
6. Consider the further suggestions that will more closely integrate the issued certificates with the realization of vouchers in order not to cause the costs of those certifying organizations and reserving capacity In this way, the costs and consequences of unrealized realization would be minimized.

Having in mind that "the performance audit is a procedure in which it is examined how public funds were used, in order to determine whether it was done in accordance with the principles of economy, efficiency and effectiveness and also in accordance with the planned objectives (Vidovič & Milunović, 2017), the above steps would provide a thorough analysis and thus minimize costs and eliminate the consequences of the unfulfilled but planned implementation. You need to make a record of it.

As a result of controlling the proposed model of the necessary activities for the purpose of the performance audit, a table has been created, and it is strongly recommended as a form of control that would give a better insight into the costs that may arise from issuing a certificate, in order to take the necessary steps for minimizing the absence of realization of the vouchers.

Table 1: *Control of realization of the vouchers in relation to the issued certificates*

Name of the list of restaurants / tourist organizations _____

Number.	Certificate number	Date of issue	Name and surname of the certificate owner	The period of use of the voucher from the certificate	Realization	Date of voucher submission to the Ministry of Tourism	The amount of expenses due to the cancellation of the reserved accommodation

Note: For each data in the table, it is necessary to have supporting documentation.

Authorized signature: _____

The future of the health tourism in the RS

Our country has natural resources that are not efficiently used for the development of health and tourism purposes, as well as for overall tourism and economic development. According to the fact that the RS is a country, with a very favorable geographical position, multicultural tradition, rich natural resources and historical and cultural heritage, it can be concluded that its resources are still not sufficiently used. The hospitality of the population of the Republic of Serbia in the tourism sector needs to be significantly better. In order for this to be possible, it is necessary to provide the following:

- strengthen public-private partnership in the tourism sector,
- improve the road connections between tourist destinations,
- provide a higher level of support services and highly educated tourism professionals,
- develop awareness of health tourism,
- develop awareness of environmental protection
- modernize the tourist infrastructure
- although it has been made the significant breakthroughs in the reform of the legislative framework in the field of tourism, and extensive planning documentation for the development of more than 15 regions

- and destinations has also been produced, there is still a lack of legislation on health tourism,
- although a large number of hotels, hostels and trade union resorts are sold in the process of restructuration of the economy through the privatization, still many of them do not work for years
 - activate abandoned objects and property of high value in state ownership which use allocates additional subsidies,
 - establish a system for managing tourist destinations and areas,
 - an effective functional link between the economy, tourist organizations, associations and business associations, educational and scientific institutions has not been achieved in order to form a safe, long-term and sustainable development of tourist areas and areas (Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications, 2016),
 - and it is necessary to establish;
 - a waste management system and the promotion of energy efficiency and sustainable development in tourist areas and destinations has not been established and needs to be established;
 - there is an absence of an effective program and action link between different authorities and levels of government in the implementation of the previous Strategy in the planning and implementation of infrastructure maintenance of tourist destinations, timely planning and coordination in establishing deadlines and operators (Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications, 2016), it should be established;
 - solve the issues of unregulated records and inefficient and out-of-date methodologies and implement international quality standards, system of statistical coverage and statistical monitoring of the performance of the tourism sector in the RS;
 - establish detailed evidence in Register of tourism (in Serbian Business Register Agency).
 - establish detailed records in the Register of Tourism (at the Business Registers Agency).

What is necessary for tourism organizations is to have their own plans for future sales. Various international factors (unprofessional or inconvenient work of the hotel staff, inefficient advertising, etc.) and external factors (recession, competition activities) very often require the rewriting of such plans or their rebalance (Eremić-Đodić et al., 2018a).

Here are the results of the analysis of the anonymous questionnaire and survey (grade 1-5), and also the results of the examination of the working documentation and the conducted tests, as the following conclusions:

- subsidized vouchers in national tourism helped developing hotel capacities by rating midium - 3;
- of all categories stimulated by vouchers for tourist departure, the lowest score was poor - 2 from the following groups:
 - are users of the right to financial compensation for the help and care by another person in accordance to the law on social protection
 - users of the right to financial compensation for the help and care by another person in accordance to the law on pension and disability insurance
 - by war disabled persons and civil disabled persons of war with incomes, which do not exceed the amount of 60,000 dinars per month;
 - users of the right to a financial compensation for family pension of war victims;
 - householders who have declared themselves exclusively engaged in agriculture, who are registered in the Register of Agricultural Holdings in accordance with the Law on Agriculture;
- a group of pensioners, unemployed persons and persons with incomes which do not exceed the amount of 60,000 dinars per month are rated by the average -3 in the survey;
- when it comes to increasing sales of voucher arrangements in relation to the previous year, all groups are rated with average of 3, except for the users of the right to financial compensation for the help and care by another person, who realize this right in accordance with the law regulating pension and disability insurance - bad – 2;
- only a quarter of respondents keep accurate records of health tourism, and even fewer of them sorted them out by category;
- the respondents' recommendations are that vouchers can be used for all tourist services;
- it is recommended that tourist agencies offer even better wellness programs. According to the survey there is an increase in the sale of weekend packages rating - 4;
- it is noticed that the surveyed hotels have an increase in the number of voucher users, which stimulates the family and promotes health tourism;

- it is necessary to link records on requirements and realization of them through vouchers;
- it has been noticed that there is a lack of information given to the competent institutions which leads to poor control and insufficient data;
- the lack of adequate procedures and software support leads to inaccurate data and inaccurate records.

Only well organized controls can provide management in the tourism industry with timely information on the basis of which they will make an additional allocation of resources, make changes to the range of products/services, and, when necessary, make corrections of their plans (Eremić-Đodić et al., 2018a).

This creates a good basis for introducing a continuous monitoring in this area, which is the ultimate goal of each audit.

Conclusion

Considering the resources of our country: hot springs, wellness services, spa and mountain tourism, nature protected resorts, good traffic connections between spa and mountains, The Republic of Serbia could take a high place in the development of health tourism. However, it is also necessary to take certain measures in order to increase its competitiveness in the following areas:

- wellness tourism,
- medical tourism,
- health tourism.

The development priorities of all the above mentioned categories should include the improvement of the offer through the quality of the provided services and better communication with the target groups as well as more professional staff and improvement of certain institutions through international certification, and others.

Health tourism represents a special form of tourism in the world. The permanent development of preventive medicine and technology significantly contribute to a better understanding of health. That is why, besides the life expectancy, the majority sets themselves to preserve their optimal health at the most important goal. In this way, the orientation towards health increasingly affects the increase in the annual growth rate,

which points to a new form of tourism - health tourism. It is not difficult to see that health tourism in the future has the potential to become one of the main motives for traveling.

Assessing the suggested model of financing in the function of the performance audit of health tourism financing by vouchers, the Republic of Serbia has made a great step forward.

The proposed audit procedure provides a detailed analysis that measures the efficiency of spending the funds received in vouchers more accurately. Applying the previous mentioned, we make connection between tourist organizations and health institutions. It leads to mutual benefits and the ultimate goal is the development of the Republic of Serbia.

References

1. Andrić, M., Krsmanović, B. & Jakšić, D. (2012). Revizija – teorija i praksa, V izdanje. Univerzitet u Novom Sadu, Ekonomski fakultet u Subotici.
2. Eremić-Đodić, J. & Tomić, A. (2018a), Development of the financing model for tourism of local governments in the function of the performance audit. Tourism in the Era of Digital Transformation, Thematic Proceedings I of the Third International Scientific Conference Tourism in function of development of the Republic of Serbia, Vrnjačka Banja, 692-707.
3. Eremić-Đodić, J., Sedlak, O. & Tomić, A. (2018b). Defining the control points of forensic audit in the insurance sector, Insurance In The Post-Crisis Era, International Scientific Conference 2018, Aranđelovac, Ekonomski fakultet Beograd, Serbia, 457-473.
4. International Federation of Accountants, (2009). Handbook of International Standards on Auditing and Quality Control. <http://www.ifac.org>.
5. Marković, L. (2019). What is Tourism, Pc-press, 26.02.2019.,1.
6. Ministry of Trade, Tourism and Telecommunications. (2016). Tourism development Strategy of the Republic of Serbia 2016 – 2025,

<http://mtt.gov.rs/download/3/TOURISM%20DEVELOPMENT%20STRATEGY%20OF%20RS%202016-2025.pdf>, (26 February 2019).

7. Popović, J., Novović, M. & Vukadinović, S. (2013). Marketinški pristup razvoju zdravstvenog turizma u Republici Srbiji, FBIM Transactions, Vol. 1 No. 2, 124-135.

8. Types of tourism, <http://www.ef.uns.ac.rs/Download/ekonomika-turizma-i-ugostiteljstva/2013-03-04-vrste-turizma.pdf>, (26 February 2019).

9. Vidovič, Z. & Milunović, M. (2017). Audit of businesses purpose. Oditör - časopis za Menadžment, finansije i pravo, Vol. 3 No. 2, 37-53.